

19 JAN 88

POINTS OF ANALYTICAL DISAGREEMENT REGARDING REPORTS OF MR. SC

JCRC letter of 10 SEP 87 to HQ AFMPC/DPMCB - "...only Colonel NAME's loss was correlative with the reported information. His incident occurred in 1972, he was flying a jet, and the location was accurate in that the alleged crash site was on NAME's stated reconnaissance heading."

- INCIDENT DATE is inconsistently reported, admittedly uncertain hearsay, as well as incorrect.
- AIRCRAFT TYPE cannot be determined from report.
- RECONNAISSANCE HEADING of NAME is not a conclusive factor in determining his downpoint. He had enough fuel for over 1800 miles of flight, and could have changed heading.
- NAME'S DOWNPOINT was changed in 1975 by JCRC on basis of an unsubstantiated rumor by an unidentified NVN source. Original downpoint (based on Mission Data Sheet-loss site) puts NAME down 17km farther north.
- VILLAGE NAME is given by source is assumed to be another by JCRC (Ban Nong Hie).
- COORDINATES offered by JCRC for Ban Nong Hie are consistent only in their incorrectness.
- CRASH/CHUTE/BURIAL SITES are consistently reported by source in all three interviews. In 2nd interview JCRC misquotes what source said in 1st interview, and wrongly accuses him of it in his 3rd interview. He denies it and sticks to his story.
- PHOTOGRAPH is not necessarily that of the pilot of the wreckage.

22 JAN 88

SUBJECT: Points of disagreement with the JCRC analysis of information offered by Mr. SC

JCRC LETTER of 10 SEP 87 to HQ AFMPC/DPMCB - "...only Colonel NAME'S loss was correlative with the reported information. His incident occurred in 1972, he was flying a jet, and the location was accurate in that the alleged crash site was on NAME'S stated reconnaissance heading."

INCIDENT DATE: Date of Ban Lop Ku Kiet (associated by source to date of incident) is uncertain hearsay, inconsistently reported, and incorrect. Data follows:

- T87-025 - No date given.
- T87-025A - Source "seemed to recall" being told the incident happened during Ban Lop Ku Kiet 1971 - 1972.
- T87-025B - Source "vaguely recalled" hearing the incident happened during Ban Lop Ku Kiet 1972 - 1973, but he remembers "Ban Lop Ku Kiet" as being 1969 - 1973.
- VO-PW - Ban Lop Ku Kiet was actually 1965 - 1968.

AIRCRAFT TYPE: Type of aircraft was based on unsubstantiated hearsay and on the appearance of an old wreckage seen from 1/2 kilometer away. After more than ten years, the absence of a visible propeller does not necessarily indicate there never was one. Therefore, this absence does not necessarily make the "wreckage" a jet. Besides, if the source was "not close enough to see" the tail section himself, he probably was not close enough to see a propeller either. Data follows:

- JCRC REFNO 1950-0-01 - NAME was lost in 1972.
- T87-025 - Source saw wreckage in 1983.
No mention of aircraft type.
Source allegedly saw a tail section with US flag on it.
- T87-025A - Source said he "could only see scattered silver pieces of unidentifiable wreckage."
Source was "not close enough to see" tail section/flag.
Source was told it was a jet by a stranger (Boonma) in a workmen's club.
- T87-025B - Source did not see a propeller, so assumed it was a jet.

RECONNAISSANCE HEADING: NAME'S planned reconnaissance heading is not a conclusive factor in determining his downpoint. He had enough fuel for 3000km of flight, and he could have changed heading. SAR efforts never detected any transmissions or located a crash site.

Data follows:

- 388TFW MSG, 02 0415Z DEC72 - "last known radio contact was at 02 0300Z. Coordinates are approx 1924N 10407E." (VG080455)

388TFW MSG, 02 0655Z DEC72 - "would have experienced fuel starvation at 0540Z."
388TFW MSG, 06 1040Z DEC72 - "An electronic search was made of the area with negative results, SAR effort terminated at 03 0830Z."
AF FORM 484/SUMMARY - "SAR efforts were begun immediately, but were terminated on 4 Dec 72 (local) with no voice or visual contact..."
JANE'S AIRCRAFT - an A-7D has "max level speed of 1,123kmh."

DOWNPOINT: NAME 's downpoint was changed by JCRC in MAR 75 on the basis of an unsubstantiated rumor reported by an unidentified source. The original downpoint based on information given by the wingman, puts NAME 17km farther north. Data follows:

JCRC REFNO 1950, PARA 7 - (15 Oct 75) NAME 's "Incident/Last Known Location changed from VG120565 to VG157405 based on IIR-237-0032-75, USDAO Vientiane, Mar 75, SUBJ: Possible US Crash Site"
IIR-237-0032-75 - Unnamed source reported seeing some wreckage and having "a vague recollection" of a "rumor" he heard from an "unidentified NVN police" about a "possible crash site of a jet." Nothing seen "which indicated nationality of aircraft."

AF FORM 484/MISSION DATA - Loss Location is "LAOS 1930N 10410E" (UTM VG 130570)

VILLAGE NAME/COORDINATES: Source consistently states one village name that JCRC assumes to actually be another. Coordinates offered by JCRC are consistent only in their incorrectness. Data follows:

T87-025 - Source names SC
JCRC says it's probably SC at VE 0847.
T87-025A - Source names SC
JCRC says it's probably "Ban Nong Hie" at UG 0847.
T87-025B - Village name and location not mentioned.
MAP/INDEX - SC is located at VG 0847.

CRASH/CHUTE/BURIAL SITE: Source remains consistent throughout all three interviews concerning the location of the airman's downpoint/grave site in relation to the crash site and village. In his 2nd interview JCRC misquotes what he said in his 1st interview, and wrongly accuses him of it in his 3rd interview. He denies it and sticks to his story. Data follows:

T87-025 - Source saw wreckage near western edge of village, 500 meters north of Hwy 7.
Source heard chute downpoint was approx 2km north of village.

- Source heard airman was killed/buried near chute downpoint, approx 2km north of village.
- T87-025A - Source saw wreckage 500 meters off (downhill) left side of road, (as coming from Laos towards SC Source was told airman was buried within 200 meters of crashsite.
- T87-025B - Source saw wreckage 2km north of village, 500 meters north of Hwy 7.
Source heard burial site was near crash site.
- MAP - (VO-PW note FYI) HWY 7 heads northwest out of village towards Laotian border.

PHOTOGRAPH: There is nothing to tie the photograph to the wreckage other than a boastful story, told to the source 4 years previously by a stranger (Boonma) in a worker's club, about an alleged event that happened a decade before. Further, Boonma never actually says that the "pilot" in the photograph was the pilot of the same plane that source saw wreckage of. Data follows:

- T87-025 - Boonma said "...the photograph was that of a US pilot." Boonma told source "he had personally been involved in the shootdown of the pilot." Source can't describe insignia or rank.
- T87-025A - Source did not read the write-up which was posted with the photograph. He could only recall the insignia was yellow, but not what it looked like.
- T87-025B - Still can't recall insignia shape. When asked to select one from a series of sketches, he selects MAJ and LTC leaves.

CONCLUSION: Information offered by Mr. SC cannot be correlated to the loss of NAME USAF.

PREPARED BY: Ms. AN
Intelligence Research Analyst
DIA/VO-PW2

ENCLOSURES:

1. JCRC letter of 10 SEP 87 to HQ AFMPC/DPMCB.
2. T87-025 - JCRC/ interview #1
3. T87-025A - JCRC/ SC interview #2
4. T87-025B - JCRC/ interview #3
5. Ban Lop Ku Kiet date info from former Lao Royal Army GEN AN
6. JCRC Bio/Site Report, REFNO 1950-0-01, NAME pp 1365, para 7
7. MSG 388TFW KORAT RTAFB THAI, 02 0415Z DEC 72
8. MSG 388TFW KORAT RTAFB THAI, 020655Z DEC 72
9. MSG 388TFW KORAT RTAFB THAI, 06 1040Z DEC 72
10. AF Form 484, 08 DEC 72, Intel Case File Report, NAME
11. Jane's All The Worlds Aircraft - 1968 - 1969, pg 320.
12. IIR-237-0032-75, USDAO Vientiane, MAR 75.
13. Index to Names on 1:50,000 Maps of Vietnam, L7014, VOL II, pg 325.
14. Map of Vietnam 1:50,000, Sheet 5847 IV, series L7014

RE: Source report by LAO Refugee

sc

DIA correlates this report to Capt Cherry, USAF. Capt Cherry was downed in 1967, and shows up on circle search 2.4 KM away from area source described. Using a map, his area shows up as within 1 KM of area source described.

JCRC correlates this report to NAME USAF. NAME was downed in 1972, and shows up on circle search as 10.2 KM away from area source described. NAME actual down point is unknown. This down point is an estimate based on NAME last radio transmission and where he would have run out of fuel.

MAJOR POINTS OF CONTENTION: (Note - JCRC made these points prior to receiving report of reinterview with Source.)

DATE:

Source stated that he seemed to recall that the villager told him the incident took place during the "Ban Lop Ku Kiet" period of 1971-72. Upon reinterview Source said the villager told him the crash occurred in 1972 or 73, however source remembered the "Ban Lop Ku Kiet" period as being 1969-1973.

DIA: Former Lao Royal Army General AN places the "Ban Lop Ku Kiet" period as 1965-1968. This would correlate with Capt Cherry's incident.

JCRC: Correlates report based on 1971-1972 time frame which correlates to NAME .

TYPE OF AIRCRAFT:

Villager told source that aircraft wreckage was that of a jet.

When reinterviewed Source stated he said it was a jet only because the villager told him it was a jet and because there was no propeller in the wreckage.

DIA: Source has no definite knowledge that it was a jet, therefore type of aircraft was not given strong consideration in correlation.

JCRC: NAME was flying a jet, and Cherry a propeller driven aircraft. This is strong evidence that it is NAME's aircraft wreckage Source saw.

PILOTS DEATH:

Source saw photograph, on the wall of a building, of a dead pilot lying on the ground. His uniform was stained with blood and one of his legs was twisted up as if broken. During reinterview Source could not recall which leg had been twisted as if broken.

Initially Source said he heard from the villager that the pilot

parachuted from the aircraft and landed approximately 2 KM north of Ban Nong De (Hie) Village. The pilot reportedly had broken his leg upon landing, but continued to resist capture. He was eventually killed and buried near the spot where he landed. Upon reinterview Source stated that the body has actually been buried near the crashsite and he had meant to say that the pilot parachuted from the aircraft when it crashed approximately 2 KM from Ning Hie Village.

DIA: Capt Cherry's crashsite was reported by another source to have been photographed, therefore this could be a picture of Cherry. This could be a totally unrelated photograph however, or even an embellishment of the story altogether. Due to the hearsay nature of the information on the pilots landing and death, DIA feels that a strong correlation based on this portion of the report is not possible.

JCRC: Cherry's aircraft was observed from when it entered a nearly vertical dive at 13,000 feet until it crashed. The pilot did not exit the aircraft. This does not correlate to Sources information that the pilot was killed resisting capture. Due to the fact that ^{NAME} fate is unknown, it is possible that he would have been alive and the sequence of events could have occurred.