



DEPARTMENT OF THE NAVY
BUREAU OF MEDICINE AND SURGERY
2300 E STREET NW
WASHINGTON DC 20372-5300

5360 IN REPLY REFER TO
MED-332/3U765513
7 Jun 93

Mrs. Mary Louise Hall

Dear Mrs. Hall:

After Mr. John Rogers' visit to your home on May 14, 1993, we forwarded your request for DNA analysis on the teeth of CILHI 0008-93, proposed identification as your late husband, Captain Harley H. Hall, USN, to Lieutenant Colonel Johnnie E. Webb, Jr, Commander, U.S. Army Central Identification Laboratory, Hawaii (CILHI).

Colonel Webb recently responded to this Bureau. In his letter, he stated that CILHI has recommended an identification of the biological remains designated CILHI 0008-93 as those of Captain Harley H. Hall. The remains consist of three teeth and small fragments of bone. The identification was recommended based on an antemortem-postmortem dental radiographic match and supporting circumstantial evidence. This recommendation has been reviewed by the CILHI scientific staff and Board Certified Forensic Consultants and all agree, that within reasonable scientific certainty, the remains designated CILHI 0008-93 are those of Captain Harley H. Hall.

Colonel Webb further states that the use of emerging mitochondrial DNA (mtDNA) technology, as a potential identification tool on cases from Southeast Asia, has been evaluated at CILHI for the past one and a half years, and has lead to a determination that this technology is not applicable to all cases. Most importantly, the submission of a sample (which may be consumed in the process) in no way guarantees that the mtDNA can be extracted, amplified and sequenced. The dental radiographic match is an equally powerful identification tool, and an attempt to obtain a mtDNA comparison is considered redundant and unnecessary.

In addition, Colonel Webb states that the current DNA policy of the Army Casualty and Memorial Affairs, Alexandria, Virginia states that DNA comparison will be used when other identification techniques are impracticable, and will not be used to routinely confirm identifications which were made using scientific methods accepted by the forensic community. In view of the foregoing, CILHI cannot support submitting any of the teeth for mtDNA testing.

This Bureau agrees with the CILHI recommendation, supported by the three forensic consultants, in that, within reasonable scientific certainty, the remains of CILHI 0008-93, are in fact, the remains of your late husband, Captain Harley H. Hall.

Considering the above, and in accordance with the Procedures for Consideration of Identification of Remains by the Armed Forces Identification Review Board (AFIRB), you have the option of having an independent professional examination of the case file/x-rays, and the remains at your own expense, and of submitting, within a reasonable period of time, additional written matters to this Bureau, which will be included in the case file for submission to the AFIRB for review and action.

I have enclosed a list of professional dentists that are all Diplomates of the American Board of Forensic Odontology.

Upon your request, this Bureau will have the remains transported from Hawaii to the expert of your choice (with an escort), and at no expense to you. After your expert examines the remains, our escort will return the remains to the Travis Air Force Base Mortuary, to await the final outcome of the identification procedures.

If you do not desire to have a consultant of your choice review the case file/x-rays, or examine the remains for a second opinion on the recommended identification, we will forward the file to the AFIRB in late July, for their review and action.

Request you respond to this Bureau in writing, ATTN: MED-332, at your earliest convenience. If you have any questions, Mr. Rogers can be reached toll free at 1-800-842-3668.

Sincerely,



E. R. GHENT
Commander, Medical Service Corps
United States Navy
Director, Patient Administration
Division
By direction of the Chief,
Bureau of Medicine and Surgery

Encl:

- (1) Listing of Diplomates of the American Board of Forensic Odontology

AMERICAN BOARD OF FORENSIC ODONTOLOGY

2/06/86

Diplomate Listing

Page: 1

ACCOUNT NUMBER	NAME	CERTIF NUMBER	EXPIR YEAR
00236	WILLIAM E. ALEXANDER, DMD ORAL SURGERY BUILDING 1400 MILL STREET EUGENE OR 97401 TELEPHONE: (503) 686-9750	034	87
00237	EDWIN E. ANDREWS, DMD 16 OAKWOOD DRIVE OKLAHOMA CITY OK 73121-5411 TELEPHONE: (405) 424-2631	016	86
00245	JOSEPH ANTHONY ANSELMO LAC-USC MEDICAL CENTER 1200 N. STATE STREET OPD LP-55 LOS ANGELES CA 90033 TELEPHONE: (213) 226-5051	066	90
00209	HASKELL ASKIN, DDS 1011 STATE HIGHWAY 70 BRICK NJ 08723	042	85
00242	ROBERT EMMETT BARSLEY 1100 FLORIDA AVENUE LSUSD BOX 140 NEW ORLEANS LA 70119 TELEPHONE: (504) 948-8683	067	90
00243	ALAN-STUART BENOVO 5151 N. PALM SUITE 70 FRESNO CA 93704 TELEPHONE: (209) 436-8062	068	90
00238	JOHN K. BERK 15921 EAST FOURTEENTH ST. SAN LEANDRO CA 94578 TELEPHONE: (415) 276-5859	069	90
00240	MARK L. BERNSTEIN, DDS 1286 WILLOW AVE LOUISVILLE KY 40204	048	87
00241	J. WILLIAM BLAIR, DDS 12 BAY CREST PLACE, S.W. CALGARY, ALBERTA T2U 0W7 CANADA	045	85
00242	RODNEY E. BROWN, DDS 200 N. SAINT JOSEPH AVE. EVANSVILLE IN 47712	049	87
00243	EDWARD R. BULPITT, DDS 266 W. YANEY STREET BISHOP CA 93514	032	87
* ✓ 00244	HOMER CAMPBELL, DDS STAR ROUTE BOX 718 PO Box 133 TIJERAS NM 87059 (505) 281-9121	018	87
00245	LAURENCE S. CHEEVERS, BDS, DDS 2495 COMMERCIAL DRIVE VANCOUVER, B.C. V5N 4B8 CANADA	031	87
00246	EDWARD V. COMULADA, DDS 11 BENTHILL COURT LAFAYETTE CA 94549	019	87

AMERICAN BOARD OF FORENSIC ODONTOLOGY

2/06/86

Diplomate Listing

Page: 2

ACCOUNT NUMBER	NAME	CERTIF NUMBER	EXPIR YEAR
✓* -00223	JAMES A. COTTONE, DMD DEPT OF DENTAL DIAG SCIENCE UNIV OF TX HEALTH SC CENTER 7703 FLOYD CURL DRIVE SAN ANTONIO TX 78284	055	89
00254	RODNEY CROW, DDS 2100 HIGHWAY 183 FT. WORTH TX 76106	047	87
00249	DUANE T. DeVORE, DDS 2701 N. CALVERT STREET BALTIMORE MD 21218	015	88
00250	ROBERT B.J. DORION, BS, DDS SUITE 710-D, SUN LIFE BLDG. 1155 METCALFE MONTREAL P.O. H3B 2V6 CANADA	008	86
00251	WILLIAM L. FARRELL, DDS REDDING DENTAL MALL 2701 EUREKA WAY REDDING CA 96001	036	88
00252	B. KALMAN FRIEDMAN, DDS 42 GREENE AVENUE AMITYVILLE NY 11701	020	87
00210	GEORGE FURST, DDS 7544 199TH STREET FLUSHING NY 11366	043	85
00248	PHILLIP R. GERON, DDS P.O. BOX 2152 UNION NJ 07083 TELEPHONE: (201) 687-6998	050	87
00255	WILLIAM S. GILES, DDS 2335 OAKDALE ROAD HILLSBOROUGH CA 94010	021	87
00256	GREGORY S. GOLDEN, DDS 77 EAST 7TH ST. UPLAND CA 91786	051	87
00257	ARTHUR D. GOLDMAN, DDS 22 OAKWOOD TERRACE SPRING VALLEY NY 10977	004	86
00258	JIM B. HALES, DDS 3000 N. MACARTHUR BLVD. IRVING TX 75062	037	88
00224	PETER F. HAMPL, DDS 1901 S. CEDAR, SUITE 106 TACOMA WA 98405	056	89
00260	EDWARD E. HERSCHAFT, DDS, MA ASSOCIATE PROF. ORAL PATH. COL OF DEN MED/MED UNIV OF SC 171 ASHLEY AVE CHARLESTON SC 29405	038	88
00261	GEORGE M. ISAAC, DDS 200 VISTA DEL RAY EL PASO TX 79912	052	87

AMERICAN BOARD OF FORENSIC ODONTOLOGY
Diplomate Listing

2/06/86

Page: 3

ACCOUNT NUMBER	NAME	CERTIF NUMBER	EXPIR YEAR
00246	DONALD DEAN JEFFRIES 1721 CRESTMONT DRIVE BAKERSFIELD CA 93306 TELEPHONE: (305) 325-9466	070	90
00262	L. THOMAS JOHNSON, DDS SUITE B, 252 BAY SHORE MALL 5900 N. PORT WASHINGTON RD. GLENDALE WI 53217	033	87
00263	THOMAS L. JOHNSON, DDS 7690 VALLEY VISTA CUCAMONGA CA 91730	053	87
00264	ALVIN W. KAGEY, DDS 5720 WILLIAMSON ROAD ROANOKE VA 24021	046	85
00225	ROBERT P. KELLY, DDS 951 NORTH TUSTIN AVENUE ORANGE CA 92667	057	89
00240	JOHN PATRICK KENNEY 101 S. WASHINGTON STREET PARK RIDGE IL 60068	071	90
00266	THOMAS C. KRAUSS, DDS 252 F STREET PHILLIPSBURG KS 67661	022	87
* ✓ 00267	LOWELL J. LEVINE, DDS 2 RIGGER COURT HUNTINGTON STATION NY 11746	007	86
* ✓ 00268	LESTER L. LUNTZ, DDS <i>to visit CIL ref</i> 111 PEARL STREET <i>changed</i> HARTFORD CT 06103 TELEPHONE: (203) 233-4288	014	86
00226	JOHN D. McDOWELL, DDS 330 MAINE STREET LAWRENCE KS 66044	058	89
00270	JAMES B. McGIVNEY, DDS 346 TULIP DRIVE WEBSTER GROVES MO 63119	059	89
00272	CURTIS A. MERTZ, DDS 2101 EAST 41ST STREET ASTABULA OH 44004 TELEPHONE: (216) 992-3144	003	86
00273	HARRY H. MINCER, DDS, MS, PHD UNIV OF TN/CNTR FOR HEALTH SC DEPT OF PATHOLOGY 858 MADISON AVENUE MEMPHIS TN 38163	039	88
00227	EDWARD R. MOFSON, DDS 50 PRESIDENTIAL PLAZA SYRACUSE NY 13202	060	89
00228	FRANK A. MORGAN, DDS 917 N. PINES RD. SPOKANE WA 99206 TELEPHONE: (509) 926-6238	061	89

AMERICAN BOARD OF FORENSIC ODONTOLOGY

2/06/86

Diplomate Listing

Page: 4

ACCOUNT NUMBER	NAME	CERTIF NUMBER	EXPIR YEAR
00229	W/ USAF — WILLIAM M. MORLANG, II, DDS 3188 SOUTHFIELD DRIVE BEAVERCREEK OH 45385	062	89
00236	PHILLIP ELTON O'SHAUGHNESSY 4626 WEST JEFFERSON BLVD. FORT WAYNE IN 46804 TELEPHONE: (219) 432-0577	072	90
00233	EDWARD J. PAVLIK, DDS 2555 W. LINCOLN HIGHWAY OLYMPIA FIELDS IL 60461	044	85
00278	GERALD B. PROHASKA, DDS, MS 6800-B MONTGOMERY BLVD, NE ALBUQUERQUE NM 87109	023	87
00280	RAYMOND D. RAWSON, DDS, MA 4121 W. SAHARA AVENUE LAS VEGAS NV 89102	040	88
00234	GERALD M. REYNOLDS, DDS 1393 GRAY AVENUE YUBA CITY CA 95991 TELEPHONE: (916) 671-2580	063	89
00230	WILBUR B. RICHIE, DDS 25001 RIDGEWAY ROAD GOLDEN CO 80401	064	89
00283	NEAL R. RIESNER, DDS 50 POPHAM ROAD SCARSDALE NY 10583	025	87
00284	ELIZABETH M. ROBINSON, DDS 11925 PEARL ROAD STRONGVILLE OH 44136	054	87
00285	STANLEY M. SCHWARTZ, DDS TUFTS UNIV/SCH OF DENTAL MED 1 KNEELAND STREET BOSTON MA 02111	006	86
00286	DAVID B. SCOTT, DDS 10448 WHEATRIDGE DRIVE SUN CITY AZ 85373	010	86
00288	DAVID R. SIPES, DDS, MFS 135 CENTER STREET SOUTH VIENNA VA 22180	041	88
00290	RICHARD R. SOUVIRON, DDS 336 ALHAMBRA CIRCLE CORAL GABLES FL 33134	002	86
00237	DUANE ELWYN SPENCER 1855 SAN MIGUEL DRIVE SUITE 9 WALNUT CREEK CA 94596 TELEPHONE: (415) 937-0935	073	90
00291	NORMAN D. SPERBER, DDS 3737 MORAGA AVE., SUITE 302 A SAN DIEGO CA 92117	027	87
00292	S. MILES STANDISH, DDS, MS IN UNIV SCH OF DENTISTRY DEPT OF ORAL DIAG/ORAL MED 1121 W. MICHIGAN ST INDIANAPOLIS IN 46202	028	87

AMERICAN BOARD OF FORENSIC ODONTOLOGY

Diplomate Listing

2/06/86

ACCOUNT
NUMBER

NAME

CERTIF
NUMBER

EXPIR
YEAR

ACCOUNT NUMBER	NAME	CERTIF NUMBER	EXPIR YEAR
00293	PAUL G. STIMSON, DDS, MS UNIV OF TX/HEALTH SC CNTR DENTAL BRANCH/DEPT OF PATH P.O BOX 20068 HOUSTON TX 77025	009	86
00294	GERALD L. VALE, DDS, JD LAC-USC MEDICAL CENTER 1200 NORTH STATE STREET OPD 1055 LOS ANGELES CA 90033	005	86
00295	<i>USCG</i> GEORGE T. WARD, DDS U.S. COAST GUARD TRAINIG CNTR DENTAL CLINIC GOVERNMENT ISLAND ALAMEDA CA 94501	012	86
00296	WILLIAM P. WEBSTER, DDS, MS UNIV. OF NORTH CAROLINA BOX 110, N.C.M.H. CHAPEL HILL NC 27514	035	88
00231	MICHAEL H. WEST, DDS RT. 13, BOX 82 HATTIESBURG MS 39401	065	89
00244	RONALD JAMES WICKUM 550 WATER ST. BLDG. K-1 SANTA CRUZ CA 95060 TELEPHONE: (408) 423-2400	074	90
00298	<i>USN</i> JOHN P. WILLIAMS, DDS, MS 4410 MAYFLOWER ROAD NORFOLK VA 23508	013	86
00299	JAMES D. WOODWARD, DMD, M.ED PROF, DEPT PROSTHODONTICS SCHOOL OF DENTISTRY UNIV. OF LOUISVILLE LOUISVILLE KY 40292	029	87
00300	EDWARD D. WOOLRIDGE, DDS, LLB 6204 SIERRA COURT MANASSAS VA 22111	001	86

* been to CILMI